

AGENDA ITEM DEVELOPMENT REPORT

OFFICE OF THE COUNTY MANAGER
CLARK COUNTY, NEVADA

AIDR No.: 3713

KEVIN SCHLLER
County Manager

Date: 7/31/23

Agenda Date: 9/5/23

JESSICA L. COLVIN
Chief Financial Officer

Originating

Department: Finance / Purchasing & Contracts

ABIGAIL FRIERSON
Deputy County Manager

Contact/Ext: Scott Clark / x5807

LES LEE SHELL
Deputy County Manager

**Issue: RECOMMENDATION OF THE
SELECTION OF FIRM**

Subject/Title:

RFQ No. 606271-22, 1 October Memorial

Recommended Action:

Approve, adopt and authorize a design concept for the 1 October Memorial from the semi-finalists in the RFQ No. 606271-22. The 1 October Memorial Committee recommends the selection of JCJ Architecture, PC as the primary and Olin Partnership, Ltd as an alternate for design concept created for a 1 October Memorial; or take other action as appropriate.

Summary:

On August 1, 2022, Request for Qualification (RFQ) No. 606271-22 was advertised on the Clark County Purchasing website and in the Las Vegas Review Journal. Submittals were requested for 1 October Memorial designs.

Submittals were received from the following firms: Aaron Neubert Architects and studioSTIGSGAARD (NBE), assemblageSTUDIO (NBE), Cliff Garten Studio (SBE), Concepts Architecture (WBE), Depena Studio (MBE), Folwell Studios, LLC dba Folwell Collective (WBE), Foundation9, LLC (SBE), Gensler Architecture, Design & Planning, P.C. (NBE), Hanlon Sculpture Studio LLC (SBE), Humanity Memorial Inc. (MBE), JCJ Architecture, PC (LBE), OJB Landscape Architecture (NBE), Olin Partnership, Ltd (WBE), Paul Murdoch Architects (SBE), Posner Fine Art, Inc. (WBE), PUNCH (NBE), R W Turk Construction, LLC (SBE), Stayner Architects (SBE), Steelman Partners (WBE), SWA Group (LBE), and The WLB Group, Inc. (LBE). The submittal received from Anthony James Studio was not evaluated because the vendor did not meet the minimum qualification.

An Ad-Hoc Committee comprised of 7 individuals reviewed and evaluated the submittals. After the evaluation, the Ad-Hoc Committee ranked the firms in the following order: JCJ Architecture, PC, Olin Partnership, Ltd, Paul Murdoch Architects, SWA Group, Aaron Neubert Architects and studioSTIGSGAARD, Cliff Garten Studio, Depena Studio, Folwell Studios, LLC dba Folwell Collective, Gensler Architecture, Design & Planning, P.C., assemblageSTUDIO, Stayner Architects, PUNCH, The WLB Group, Inc., Posner Fine Art, Inc., Steelman Partners,

AIDR No.: 3713

Page 2

July 31, 2023

Foundation9, LLC, R W Turk Construction, LLC, Humanity Memorial Inc., OJB Landscape Architecture, Hanlon Sculpture Studio LLC, and Concepts Architecture.

Subsequent to the evaluation of the written submittals, the committee selected the following 5 firms as semi-finalist: Aaron Neubert Architects and studioSTIGSGAARD, JCJ Architecture, PC, Olin Partnership, Ltd, Paul Murdoch Architects, and SWA Group.

An Ad-Hoc Committee comprised of 6 individuals reviewed and evaluated the design concepts of the 5 semi-finalists. Subsequent to this evaluation, the Ad-Hoc Committee ranked the semi-finalists in the following order: JCJ Architecture, PC, Olin Partnership, Ltd, Aaron Neubert Architects and studioSTIGSGAARD, Paul Murdoch Architects, and SWA Group.

On July 26, 2023, the semi-finalist ranking was presented to the 1 October Memorial Committee. The 1 October Memorial Committee approved the selection of the top ranked firm as well as the 2nd ranked firm to be considered as an alternate should the top ranked firm not produce a satisfactory Contract.

The 1 October Memorial Committee recommends the selection of JCJ Architecture, PC as primary and Olin Partnership, Ltd as an alternate.

At a future public meeting, the Board of County Commissioners may enter into an agreement with a non-profit for the construction and operation of a 1 October Memorial. The 1 October Memorial Committee has recommended JCJ Architecture, PC, as the primary and Olin Partnership, Ltd as an alternate for design concept created for a 1 October Memorial. The approval and authorization of this selection does not obligate the County to enter into any type of agreement with either JCJ Architecture, PC or Olin Partnership, Ltd. The RFQ was conducted to solicit design concepts for a permanent 1 October Memorial while engaging the public in the process.

In accordance with NRS 332.115.1 (b), the competitive bidding process is not required as the services to be performed are professional in nature. Pursuant to internal policies and procedures, Clark County solicited these services through the RFQ process.

The following is the evaluation criteria and weighting of each section used by the evaluation team. All evaluators' scores were averaged.

Round 1 – Initial Evaluation

Criteria	Points
19. A Professional Licensure/Certification	N/A
19. B. Cover Letter	N/A
19. C. Organization Information	5 pts
19. D. Firm Information	5 pts
19. D Firm Information	5 pts
19. D Firm Information	5 pts
19. E. Qualifications	10 pts
19. E. Qualifications	5 pts
19. E. Qualifications	5 pts
19. F. Letter of Intent	5 pts
19. F. Letter of Intent	3 pts
19. G. Executive Summary	3 pts
19. G. Executive Summary	2 pts
19. G. Executive Summary	2 pts
19. H, Project Experience	5 pts
19. H, Project Experience	5 pts
19. H, Project Experience	5 pts
19. I. Community Engagement Experience & Local Familiarity	10 pts
19. I. Community Engagement Experience & Local Familiarity	10 pts
19. J. Budget/Schedule Adherence	5 pts
19. K. Compliance with COUNTY'S Design and Presentation Agreement	5 pts
19 L. Disclosure Form	N/A
Total	100

AIDR No.: 3713

Page 4

July 31, 2023

Round 2 – Artwork Design and Presentation

Criteria	Points
A. Design Concept Narrative and Renderings	30 pts
B. Community Outreach Efforts	30 pts
C. Envisioned Realm of User Experience	10 pts
D. Programming	10 pts
E. Team	5 pts
F. Public Response to Design from the app	15 pts
Total	100


KEVIN SCHILLER
County Manager

**ATTACHMENT 1
Evaluation Summary**

Round 1 – Initial Evaluation

Supplier	Evaluator A	Evaluator B	Evaluator C	Evaluator D	Evaluator E	Evaluator F	Evaluator G	Subtotal of Average Score	Local Presence	Compliance with Standard Contract	Total Average Score	Rank
JCJ Architecture, PC	90	89	90	77	71	84	72.6	81.94	5	5	91.94	1
OLIN Partnership, Ltd	86	84.6	87	76	83.4	78	67.6	80.37	0	4	84.37	2
Paul Murdoch Architects	62.2	85	88	87.8	76	90	56.4	77.91	0	5	82.91	3
SWA Group	33	86	90	77	86	87	78.6	76.8	0	5	81.8	4
Aaron Neubert Architects and studioSTIGSGAARD	75.6	57.2	80	64.8	84	83	33.4	68.29	5	5	78.29	5
Cliff Garten Studio	56.6	80.6	69.6	82	77.4	83	56.4	72.23	0	5	77.23	6
Depena Studio	81.4	63	76.6	61	52.6	66	54.2	64.97	0	5	69.97	7
Folwell Studios, LLC dba Folwell Collective	54	57	77.4	47.6	52.2	78.6	68.2	62.14	0	5	67.14	8
Gensler Architecture, Design & Planning, P.C.	56.4	66.6	76	48.4	37.6	66.4	53	57.77	5	5	65.77	9
assemblageSTUDIO	36.6	58	71	43.2	47	69.6	56.4	54.54	5	5	64.54	10
Stayner Architects	57	73.6	59.4	51.8	50	64	60	59.4	0	3	64.4	11
PUNCH	39	66.8	63.6	36.2	46.8	66	26.8	49.31	5	5	59.31	12
The WLB Group, Inc.	30.2	75.8	54.2	47	35.8	68	30	48.71	0	5	58.71	13
Posner Fine Art, Inc.	39.4	60.6	66.2	51	47.6	74.4	31	52.89	5	5	57.89	14
Steelman Partners	90	56.4	31	21.2	26	71.4	19.4	45.06	5	5	55.06	15
Foundation9, LLC	53	66.4	38.2	31.4	49	81	18	48.14	0	5	53.14	16
R W Turk Construction, LLC	21	58	26	37.2	45.2	70.2	13.2	38.69	5	5	48.69	17
Humanity Memorial, Inc.	76.8	48.8	14	8	28.8	58.2	21.4	36.57	5	5	46.57	18
OJB Landscape Architecture	33	44.4	30.8	49	47.4	60.4	38	43.29	0	0	43.29	19
Hanlon Sculpture Studio LLC	45.6	25.4	23.8	13.4	19.6	44.8	6.6	25.6	0	5	30.6	20
Concepts Architecture	21.6	13.6	28.4	18.8	25.8	53.8	13.2	25.03	5	5	30.03	21

Round 2 – Final Presentation

Supplier	Evaluator A	Evaluator B	Evaluator C	Evaluator D	Evaluator E	Evaluator F	Subtotal Average Score	Public Response to Design from the App	Total Average Score
JCJ Architecture, PC	83	84	80	73	75	78	78.83	9	87.83
OLIN Partnership, Ltd	50	74	64	85	78	50	66.83	15	81.83
Paul Murdoch Architects	67	83	76	74	76	73	74.83	6	80.83
SWA Group	62	68	85	72	61	55	67.17	12	79.17
Aaron Neubert Architects and studioSTIGSGAARD	61	81	62	66	75	80	70.83	3	73.83

ATTACHMENT 2

Description of Ad-Hoc Committee and 1 October Memorial Committee

Round 1

Evaluator A - Is a family member who lost his wife of 21 years on 1 October.

Evaluator B - Is a survivor who experienced physical injuries the night of 1 October.

Evaluator C - Was a first responder of the Clark County Fire Department and took part of the events and aftermath of 1 October.

Evaluator D - Is a local parks and environmental advocate with subject matter expertise.

Evaluator E - Is an artist and landscape architect with subject matter expertise.

Evaluator F - Is a survivor and has subject matter expertise with experience in design and construction.

Evaluator G - Is a Construction Project Management Supervisor for the Clark County Department of Real Property Management

Round 2

Evaluator A – Joined the Legal Aid Center of Southern Nevada as a staff attorney in the Consumer Rights Project in June of 2016. In October of 2017, the focus became ensuring victims, and their families of the Route 91 tragedy were provided needed civil legal services in the aftermath. Provided direct services on a wide variety of legal issues in the immediate response & became immersed in the victim services realm through the longer recovery effort. Is now the Director of the Vegas Strong Resiliency Center, operated by the Legal Aid Center of Southern Nevada under agreement with Clark County, Nevada.

Evaluator B – A Las Vegas native who recently graduated from UNLV as an “Outstanding Graduate of 2019” awarded by UNLV President Dr. Meana. Survived a critical gunshot wound at Route 91 but has remained heavily involved in their community. Assisted with two of the Vegas Strong Resiliency Centers public service announcements, initiated a letter writing campaign to support other cities experiencing mass shootings, as well as given a TEDx Talk at UNLV about post traumatic growth. Is committed to helping our community heal in whatever capacity she can.

Evaluator C – A local artist who spent thirty-eight years as a designer in the sign industry, including seven of those years as art director. Their public artwork can be seen at the D gates at McCarran International Airport and Left of Center Gallery in North Las Vegas.

Evaluator D – An architect who was instrumental in establishing the School of Architecture at UNLV and has been active in architectural education and the accreditation of architectural programs around the nation. Engagement with multiple arts professional committees and boards in Southern Nevada.

Evaluator E – A public art project manager for the City of Las Vegas Office of Cultural Affairs. In addition to their membership as Chair of the Clark County Public Art Committee, they serve as staff liaison for the Las Vegas Arts Commission, and Government Liaison to 18b the Las Vegas Arts District Neighborhood Association. In 2017, facilitated the collection and display of items donated to the city in response to 1 October, and also led the group assigned to create a program to manage the collection, documentation, and care for the items left at the budding Las Vegas Healing Garden site.

Evaluator F – A Law Enforcement professional with the Las Vegas Metropolitan Police Department for over 24 years. During service on the force, they held positions in Patrol, Community Oriented Policing, Internal Oversight and Constitutional Policing, Internal Affairs, and Human Resources. Helped implement groundbreaking reforms related to deadly force by officers. Many of these reforms are now counted as best practices around the County. They were a co-author of the 1 October After-Action Review that was published in 2018 and led a team during an investigation of the tragic event. Currently oversees Human Resources, all Department training, and the LVMPD volunteer program.